Health Impact Assessment: Southside Recycling Permit Application

Public Engagement Session #1: Screening, Scoping, Assessment (Part I)
Session Objectives

• Understand the purpose and process of health impact assessment (HIA).

• Describe how we are applying the HIA process to evaluate the Southside Recycling permit application.

• Identify potential community burdens and benefits.

• Discuss current environmental, health, and quality of life conditions on the Southeast side.

• Compare these conditions to the city of Chicago and Lincoln Park.
## Agenda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>AGENDA ITEM</th>
<th>PRESENTER(S)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5:00</td>
<td>Welcome: Introductions &amp; Icebreaker</td>
<td>MaKara Rumley, Hummingbird</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5:15</td>
<td>What is a Health Impact Assessment (HIA)?</td>
<td>Kate McMahon, CDPH</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 5:30   | How are we applying the HIA process to the Southside Recycling permit application? | Melissa Buenger, CDPH  
Megan Cunningham, CDPH |
| 6:00   | Current conditions on the Southeast Side                                   | Kirsti Bocskay, CDPH  
Kathryn Siegel, U.S. EPA                           |
| 6:30   | Questions & Answers                                                        | All                                              |
| 6:50   | Closeout & Next Steps                                                      | Renante Marante, CDPH  
MaKara Rumley, Hummingbird                        |
We...

- **embrace** different communication styles, especially ones farther apart from ours.
- **are mindful** of speaking time to avoid a few people dominating a meeting.
- **listen** with an open mind.
- **give and receive feedback**, criticism, and questioning.
- **seek** multiple points of view.
- **check for** diversity gaps (who is missing) and propose solutions.
- **actively pursue** engagement of less vocal members.
- **assume** good faith.
- **respect** this space as a place to work candidly during the process.

Source: Adapted from Elevated Chicago, Community Engagement Principles and Recommendations
Q&A Reminders

• There will be opportunities for input throughout the meeting.

• Ask questions in the “Q&A” box. Provide comments in the “Chat” box.

• If you would like to ask your question verbally, enter your question in the “Q&A” box, and indicate that it is a “verbal question.”

• For the most part, questions will be answered in the order in which they are received. However, we want to prioritize the voices of residents from East Side, Hegewisch, and South Deering.
  
  o If you are from these communities and would like your question prioritized, include the name of your neighborhood when you submit your question. We will also prioritize those who have not had a chance to ask a question.

• Be mindful that what you write in the chat will be monitored, and ALL inappropriate comments will be removed.
Welcome: Introductions & Icebreaker

Icebreaker

1. How well do you understand a Health Impact Assessment and its components?

2. On a scale of 1 - 10 (1 being no trust, 10 being 100% trust), how much would you trust that the HIA process can make a difference?
What is a Health Impact Assessment?
Living Conditions and Underlying Inequities Impact Health

• Health is a state of complete physical, mental, and social well-being; not just the absence of disease.
• Many factors influence how long and how well we live.
• It is important to consider health when making decisions that affect living conditions, including the environment.

Source: CDPH, Healthy Chicago 2025
What is a Health Impact Assessment?

A health impact assessment is a process that helps determine the potential effects of a proposed policy, plan, or project on health.

Community & Stakeholder Engagement

- Stakeholders are **individuals or organizations who may gain or lose from a decision or process.**

- **Community members** are important stakeholders in the health impact assessment process.
Embedding Health and Race Equity

Equity is both an outcome and a process that results in fair and just access to opportunity and resources that provide everyone the ability to thrive.

- **Define** the problem/opportunity
- **Acknowledge** history
- **Look** at numbers and narratives
- **Shift** power
- **Measure** the benefits and burdens
- **Embrace** accountability and commit to action

Sources: Chicago's Equity Statement of Principles; Health and Race Equity Impact Assessment Guiding Questions, developed by HREIA Community Accountability Committee
What a Health Impact Assessment IS and What It is NOT

What it IS…

• It is forward looking.

• It engages key stakeholders and uses data to identify benefits and burdens.

• It considers many factors that influence health and assesses short and long-term impacts.

• It explores trade-offs involved with different decisions.

What it is NOT…

• It is not an evaluation of impacts once a decision has been implemented.

• It is not the final action required to implement recommendations.

• It does not alter existing authorities, though it can inform how authority is applied and future changes.
Health Impact Assessment in Action

HIAs can...

- **Improve understanding** of the health impacts of decisions
- **Increase participation** in decision-making
- **Make recommendations** for changes to the proposal under consideration
Discussion Question

Based on the information presented, in what ways could an HIA benefit a community?
How are we applying the HIA process to the Southside Recycling permit application?
Background: RMG/Southside Recycling

- Reserve Management Group (RMG) is an Ohio based metal recycling company
- Purchased General Iron, then operating in Lincoln Park, in 2019
- Seeking permit for Southside Recycling at 11600 S. Burley
  - Planned Manufacturing District (PMD) 6
  - Calumet Industrial Corridor
- Has operated recycling facilities in the ward for 30+ years
- Would accept scrap metal, including end of life vehicles, for processing and recycling
RMG/Southside Recycling requires two permits from CDPH:
- Air Pollution Control (APC) permit
- Large Recycling Facility (LRF) permit

- Only issued if zoning and environmental requirements are met.
- Cannot operate until CDPH approves both permits.
- CDPH can require special conditions.
Background: Large Recycling Facility Rules

- **First-ever** rules for large recycling facilities in Chicago
- Received 31 written comments on draft rules; made changes due to input
- More extensive requirements than state and federal rules
Background: Permitting & Engagement Timeline

- **2019**: ZONING approved
- **2020**: ILLINOIS EPA permit approved, Large Recycling Facility rules adopted, Building permits approved, Community Town Hall #1
- **2021**: Southside Recycling application submitted, Permit review suspended, Community Town Hall #2, public comment period, deficiency letter, Additional impact analysis and engagement sessions

Coming up next...
- Health Impact Assessment (HIA) report issued
- Permit decision
Background: Stakeholder Input Received to Date

- **RMG application and supplemental materials, independent validation**
- **Public input from:**
  - 2 community meetings
  - Over 4,000 written comments, 15 organizations
  - Media coverage
- **Illinois EPA permit documents and comments**
- **U.S. EPA expertise on HIA process, methods**
What We’ll Do Today

• **HIA Step 1: Screening**
  - Determine whether an HIA is needed/valuable.

• **HIA Step 2: Scoping**
  - Identify potential community burdens and benefits.

• **HIA Step 3: Assessment, Part I**
  - Review current environmental, health, and quality of life conditions on the Southeast side.
  - Compare these conditions to Lincoln Park and the city overall.
### HIA Step 1: Screening
**Is an HIA needed/valuable?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Screening Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What is the decision target?</td>
<td>RMG/Southside Recycling permit application</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why is an HIA warranted?</td>
<td>To address environmental justice and equity concerns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who are decision-makers?</td>
<td>Chicago Department of Public Health (CDPH)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who is involved?</td>
<td>CDPH, U.S. EPA, local stakeholders, other public agencies as needed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When will the decision be made?</td>
<td>By January 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How will the HIA be used?</td>
<td>To assess environment, health, and quality of life impacts on the surrounding community and to make recommendations on the permitting decision</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### HIA Step 2: Scoping
What impacts, for whom?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCOPING QUESTION</th>
<th>RESPONSE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What communities are most impacted?</td>
<td>East Side, Hegewisch, South Deering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who are the key stakeholders?</td>
<td>People who live/work in these communities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| What questions will the HIA answer?           | • Current conditions  
• Potential impacts (environment, health, quality of life, equity)  
• Who benefits, who’s burdened  
• How to minimize burdens and maximize benefits  
• Ways to improve City policies, processes, and practices |

HIA Step 2: Scoping
Centering Environmental Justice (EJ) & Racial Equity

- **Compare conditions** on the Southeast Side to City overall and other non-EJ community areas
- **Facilitated, culturally and linguistically responsive** stakeholder engagement
- Methods are **transparent**, with all data and related materials posted online
- Assessment will also address **racial equity considerations**

Source: Illustration by Ricardo Levins Morales
What Goes into the HIA?

- Permit Application Materials
- 2 Community Town Halls
- 4,000+ Public Comments
- HIA Expert Guidance & Practice Tools
- U.S. EPA Air Quality Report
- Additional Impact Modeling & Analysis
- Additional Engagement Sessions

Complete

In Progress
As a business owner myself in the 10th Ward, I would question why a city that is losing revenue and population daily would not be supporting a local business that has been in this community for over 29 years, they provide a living wage that feeds and supports local families and children.

“RMG is putting our communities at risk by allowing dangerous pollution (PM 10 & PM 2.5) to be released so close to residences, schools, and parks.”

Good Afternoon,
We the members of the South Deering Manor Community Association write to express our concerns regarding the RMG Expansion to 11600 S. Burley on the Southeast Side of Chicago.

“As a business owner myself in the 10th Ward, I would question why a city that is losing revenue and population daily would not be supporting a local business that has been in this community for over 29 years, they provide a living wage that feeds and supports local families and children.”

“Recycling obsolete metal contributes to environmental sustainability by reusing resources instead of discarding metal waste in landfills, and it conserves energy and natural resources.”
HIA Step 2: Scoping
Identifying Potential Impacts

Based on input so far, CDPH has started to:

- **identify potential impacts** of interest/concern to stakeholders
- **connect them to health outcomes** that we will continue to analyze
HIA Step 2: Scoping

Proposed Changes

1. New large recycling facility

Short Term Outcomes

1. Truck traffic

Long Term Outcomes

1. Air quality
2. Crashes and damage to roads, homes

Health Outcomes

1. Respiratory disease
2. Cardiovascular disease
3. Poor child health
4. Cancer
5. Neurological issues
6. Injuries

Impacted Population

Nearby residents, especially the very young and old and those with underlying conditions

Source: CDPH review of community town halls, public comments
HIA Step 2: Scoping
DRAFT Impact Pathways

Source: CDPH review of community town halls, public comments
## Discussion Questions

### Impacts – What We Heard

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Environment</th>
<th>• Air pollution</th>
<th>• Water pollution</th>
<th>• Soil contamination</th>
<th>• Recycling capacity</th>
<th>• Infrastructure improvements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>• Respiratory disease</td>
<td>• Cardiovascular disease</td>
<td>• Cancer</td>
<td>• Injuries/crashes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of Life</td>
<td>• Noise</td>
<td>• Odors</td>
<td>• Truck traffic</td>
<td>• Jobs/economic opportunity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Racial Equity</td>
<td>• Community voice and power</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Which of these impacts (+/-) are **most important** to you?
- What impacts (+/-) are **missing** that should be considered?

Source: CDPH review of community town halls, public comments
Current conditions on the Southeast Side
HIA Step 3: Assessment

- The assessment step will include:
  - Part I (today): A profile of baseline conditions
  - Part II (next session): An evaluation of potential impacts
"It’s about the fact that you can take something from a community where it’s not wanted, for all the reasons it’s not wanted there, and build [it] here. We don’t have a voice about that, but they do. That’s why it’s insulting ... and that’s why we’re opposed to it."
— Peggy Salazar

Source: Darryl Fears and Robin Amer, Washington Post, Oct. 22, 2021
U.S. EPA
Southeast Chicago
Air Monitoring Analysis

November 4, 2021
EPA released report on October 21, 2021

You can visit the [website](#) to read the full report

EPA began this analysis in April 2021

This report is just one input into the HIA
Report Findings

• Concentrations of pollutants measured at George Washington High School:
  o have either decreased or remained the same over the past 10 years
  o have either decreased or remained the same—with the exception of coarse particulate matter—over the past 3 years

• Over the last 10 years, annual averages of all metals—like lead and manganese—have been below the long-term health benchmarks
Report Findings

• When compared to similar data collected in the Chicago area, Southeast Chicago is:
  o tied for highest daily fine particulate matter but below the standard
  o in the middle for annual fine particulate matter (6th highest out of 12)
  o in the middle for annual coarse particulate matter (2nd highest out of 3)

• The most recent 12-month rolling averages of manganese near facilities, where EPA required special monitoring, are all below the long-term health benchmark
Key Takeaways

✓ Report uses a data-driven approach to understand trends in the community

✓ EPA’s report is just one input into the HIA

✓ EPA will continue to engage with the community and partners on improving air quality
### Additional Community Conditions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Other Environment</th>
<th>Health</th>
<th>Quality of Life</th>
<th>Social Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Industrial land use</td>
<td>• Cancer incidence and mortality</td>
<td>• Life expectancy</td>
<td>• Social Vulnerability Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Environmental permits</td>
<td>• Cardiovascular disease prevalence, incidence and mortality</td>
<td>• Overall health</td>
<td>• Race-ethnicity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Traffic</td>
<td>• Respiratory disease prevalence, incidence and mortality</td>
<td>• Physical health</td>
<td>• Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Proximity to potentially polluting sites</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Mental health</td>
<td>• Socioeconomic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Risk of cancer and non-cancer health effects due to air toxics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Access to care</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Other Environment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Lincoln Park</th>
<th>Chicago</th>
<th>East Side</th>
<th>Hegewisch</th>
<th>South Deering</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Industrial land use (%)</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permitted facilities (＃)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic intensity</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>430</td>
<td>805</td>
<td>1,458</td>
<td>1,458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proximity to Superfund sites (distance-weighted sites)</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proximity to hazardous waste sites (distance-weighted sites)</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respiratory Hazard Index</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifetime cancer risk (per million)</td>
<td>32.8</td>
<td>33.1</td>
<td>33.5</td>
<td>38.3</td>
<td>43.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data Sources:
- Land Use Inventory, CMAP (2015)
- Environmental Permitting & Inspections, CDPH (2021)
- EJSCREEN, USEPA, Department of Transportation (2017)
- EJSCREEN, USEPA, CERCLIS (2020)
- EJSCREEN, USEPA, RCRAInfo (2020)
- EJSCREEN, USEPA, National Air Toxics Assessment (2014)
Key Findings

Compared to Lincoln Park, the Southeast Side community areas experience:

- **Other Environment**
  - more industry
  - closer to Superfund sites
  - less lifetime risk of health effects due to air toxics

- **Health**

- **Quality of Life**

- **Social Factors**
Health: Cancer

Cancer incidence (per 100,000)

Breast cancer incidence (per 100,000 females)

Lung cancer incidence (per 100,000)

Cancer mortality (per 100,000)

Breast cancer mortality (per 100,000 females)

Lung cancer mortality (per 100,000)

Health: Cardiovascular Disease

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>Lincoln Park</th>
<th>East Side</th>
<th>Hegewisch</th>
<th>Chicago</th>
<th>South Deering</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hypertension (%)</td>
<td>17.1</td>
<td>30.2</td>
<td>32.3</td>
<td>32.8</td>
<td>40.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coronary heart disease (%)</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coronary heart disease mortality (per 100,000)</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>45.3</td>
<td>48.4</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>95.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stroke (%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stroke mortality (per 100,000)</td>
<td>15.0</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>50.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stroke hospitalizations (per 100,000)</td>
<td>60614</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>60617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heart attack hospitalizations (per 100,000)</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Health: Respiratory Disease

- **Asthma (%)**: Lincoln Park: 8.2, Hegewisch East Side: 9.4, Chicago: 10.0, South Deering: 11.9
- **Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (%)**: Lincoln Park: 2.9, Hegewisch East Side: 3.3, Chicago: 6.6, South Deering: 9.0
- **Chronic lower respiratory disease mortality (COPD) (per 100,000)**: Lincoln Park: 13.3, Hegewisch East Side: 14.5, Chicago: 18.3, South Deering: 29.9
- **Asthma emergency department visits (per 100,000)**: 16.7, 24.8, 84.7, 128.3
- **COPD emergency department visits (per 100,000)**: 7.2, 10.1, 32.5, 55.3
- **COPD hospitalizations (per 100,000)**: 8.5, 9.3, 23.3, 29.0

Key Findings

Compared to Lincoln Park, the Southeast Side community areas experience:

- **Health**
  - more cardiovascular and respiratory disease
  - lower overall cancer incidence, but higher cancer mortality

- **Quality of Life**

- **Social Factors**
Quality of Life

Life expectancy (years)
- South Deering: 74.9
- Hegewisch: 77.3
- Chicago: 78.3
- East Side: 77.2
- Lincoln Park: 80.7

Overall health – excellent, very good, good (%)
- South Deering: 57.5
- Hegewisch: 78.3
- Chicago: 82.5
- East Side: 87.1
- Lincoln Park: 89.5

Poor physical health (%)
- South Deering: 5.9
- Hegewisch: 12.6
- Chicago: 14.2
- East Side: 16.4
- Lincoln Park: 17.8

Poor mental health (%)
- South Deering: 9.8
- Hegewisch: 12.7
- Chicago: 13.1
- East Side: 14.2
- Lincoln Park: 16.4

Compared to Lincoln Park, the Southeast Side community areas experience...

- **Other Environment**
- **Health**
- **Quality of Life**
  - *shorter* life expectancy
  - *worse* self-reported health
- **Social Factors**
Social Factors

Social Vulnerability Index (percentile)
- Lincoln Park: 16.3
- Hegewisch Chicago: 54.0
- East Side: 79.2
- South Deering: 90.8

People of color (%)
- Lincoln Park: 21.6
- Hegewisch Chicago: 65.0
- East Side: 86.2
- South Deering: 86.1

Limited English proficiency (%)
- Lincoln Park: 1.3
- Hegewisch Chicago: 6.5
- East Side: 7.2
- South Deering: 13.8

Per capita income ($)
- Lincoln Park: 19,130
- Hegewisch Chicago: 18,677
- East Side: 19,350
- South Deering: 19,591

Less than high school education (%)
- Lincoln Park: 2.4
- Hegewisch Chicago: 14.9
- East Side: 24.8
- South Deering: 32.0

Unemployed (%)
- Lincoln Park: 2.7
- Hegewisch Chicago: 6.1
- East Side: 8.1
- South Deering: 16.1

Uninsured (%)
- Lincoln Park: 2.5
- Hegewisch Chicago: 8.1
- East Side: 8.7
- South Deering: 10.4

Compared to Lincoln Park, the Southeast Side community areas experience...

- **Other Environment**
- **Health**
- **Quality of Life**
- **Social Factors**
  - less resiliency against the effects of environmental stressors
Air Quality & Health Index

Combines community-level data on air pollution, health, and social factors to identify the areas in our city that are more vulnerable to the effects of air pollution.

More vulnerable areas are shown in darker blue.

Data Source: City of Chicago, Air Quality and Health Report (2020); map adapted for HIA on 11/1/21
Data Considerations

- Data lag
- Small numbers/events
- Methods to ensure precision and accuracy
Key Findings

Compared to Lincoln Park, the Southeast Side community areas experience... 

### Other Environment
- more industry
- closer to Superfund sites
- less lifetime risk of health effects due to air toxics

### Health
- more cardiovascular and respiratory disease
- lower overall cancer incidence, but higher cancer mortality

### Quality of Life
- shorter life expectancy
- worse self-reported health

### Social Factors
- less resiliency against the effects of environmental stressors
Discussion Question

Does anything **surprise you** about these findings? Why or why not?
General Q&A
Closeout & Next Steps
What We Did Today

• Reviewed the purpose and process of health impact assessment.

• Described how we are applying an HIA to evaluate the Southside Recycling permit application.

• Identified potential community burdens and benefits.

• Discussed current environmental, health, and quality of life conditions on the Southeast side.

• Compared these conditions to Lincoln Park and the city overall.
Next Steps: Assessment, Part II
Potential Impacts of Southside Recycling

- **Modeling and analysis to determine:**
  - Additional air pollution
  - Additional pollution in surrounding neighborhood
  - Whether pollution exceeds standards/guidelines

- **Human Health Risk Assessment Protocol (HHRAP)**

6 STEPS OF THE HIA PROCESS

1. Screening
2. Scoping
3. Assessment
4. Recommendations
5. Reporting
6. Monitoring & Evaluation
Next Steps: Recommendations

For the next session, think about...

• How could we **maximize benefits** and **mitigate burdens** that we discussed today?

• What **changes to policies or processes** should the City consider based on this experience?
Next Steps: Feedback

Help us improve our next session...

1. What’s one big takeaway you have from today’s session?
2. What worked well in today's session?
3. What could we do differently next time?
Next Steps: Stay Involved

• **HIA Session #2:** Assessment & Recommendations
  - **Thursday, December 2nd from 5-7 p.m.** Details will be shared by email

• Today's session and related materials are posted on our [website](#)

• If you have feedback on today's session, email [envcomments@cityofchicago.org](mailto:envcomments@cityofchicago.org)